



**ENGINEERING AND OPERATIONS DEPARTMENT
ENGINEERING DIVISION**

Report Number: 2012-38

Date: December 10, 2012

**SUBJECT: PROJECT 2012-22 - REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL - ARCHITECT FOR
THE PORT COLBORNE OPERATIONS CENTRE (PCOC) DESIGN-BID-
BUILD PROJECT**

1) PURPOSE

This report is prepared by Jim Hupponen, Manager of Engineering Services under the direction of Ron Hanson, Director of Engineering and Operations. The purpose of the report is to inform Council of the outcome of the Request for Proposal (RFP) that was issued for the selection of an Architect for the Port Colborne Operations Centre (PCOC) Design-Bid-Build Project and to obtain approval from Council to award the contract to the successful consultant.

2) HISTORY, BACKGROUND, COUNCIL POLICY, PRACTICES

The City's Works Yard is no longer adequate for the present Operations and Public Works fleet and Council has agreed that a new facility is required, through presentations made at Strategic Planning and budget deliberations. In 2008 a Class Environmental Assessment (EA) was initiated to address the long term requirements of the Operations Division of the City. The Study was completed in November 2009 and after a site selection process, the City-owned land comprising of 5.7 hectares of industrial land on Stonebridge Drive was selected as the preferred site.

During budget deliberations for the 2012 Capital Budget, City Staff requested a debenture of \$800,000 which would be used to hire a Project Management firm and an Architectural firm to complete the detailed design for the construction of the new facility.

In 2011, City Staff meet with the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority (NPCA) to review the preferred site and discuss any environmental constraints. A 30.0m wetland buffer was found to be in place along the north property line and a 100 year floodplain transverses diagonally across the northeast quadrant of the property. Based on the preliminary site plan established through the EA process, it was determined that the building configurations would need to be manipulated to ensure that the site was still adequate for the New Operations Centre to be built within the environmental constraints. City Staff met with Staff from AMEC Environmental on February 23, 2012 to review the preliminary site plan. AMEC revised the buildings on the site to determine if the site was still adequate for the requirements of the Operations Department. AMEC sent a revised site plan to City Staff on March 8, 2012 showing that the site was still adequate for the requirements of the Operations Department.

During the August 27, 2012 Council meeting, Report # 2012-26 was presented to Council. Council approved the following recommendation:

- A. That the Council of the City of Port Colborne award the Request for Proposal – Qualification of Consulting Services for an Owner Advocate/Project Manager for the Port Colborne Operations Centre Design-Bid-Build Project to PRISM Partners Inc. of Burlington, Ontario for the total proposed price including Optional Services of \$191,000 plus applicable taxes;**
- B. That the project be debentured in the amount of \$191,000 excluding taxes through the Infrastructure Ontario Loan Program for a period of 30 years; and**
- C. That the appropriate By-laws be drafted and submitted for execution by the Mayor and City Clerk.**

It was determined at the August 24, 2012 Council meeting, that Mayor Badawey and Councilor Danch volunteered to sit as members of the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) for this project.

An agreement between the City and PRISM Partners was prepared in August of 2012 and a strict schedule was drafted up to begin the process of hiring an Architectural firm to begin the detailed design of the Operations Centre. See Attachment 1 for the proposed project schedule.

The TAC consists of the Mayor Badawey, Councilor Danch, the Director of Engineering & Operations, the Manager of Engineering Services, the Public Works Superintendent and PRISM Partners.

Based on the proposed schedule, the TAC prepared Request for Qualification (RFQ) documents to pre-qualify Architectural firms and a public call for submission of pre-qualification documents was issued. Proponents were required to submit pre-qualification documents in accordance with the Terms of Reference prepared by PRISM Partners and the City.

Fourteen (14) documents were received during the RFQ process. Based on the review of these documents, the TAC short-listed six (6) proponents to be interviewed and issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) document.

These six (6) proponents were interviewed and scored by the TAC based on a short 20 minute presentation and by their responses to six (6) standardized questions.

The RFP document was issued to the six (6) proponents on October 31, 2012 with a closing date of November 13, 2012. A request for an extension by two (2) of the proponents prompted the TAC to extend the closing date to November 19, 2012.

The proposals, using a “two envelope” system were reviewed and scored according to:

Category	Factor
▪ Methodology	10
▪ Qualification of Key Individuals	25
▪ Consultant Qualifications – Similar Projects	20
▪ Interview Score (Standing from Interview)	10
▪ Fee Proposal – Form 5	35

Each Category above was rated with a value ranging from 1-10 and then pro-rated by the factors above.

The Successful Proponent was required to possess a comprehensive understanding of operations centre expertise using efficient and sustainable design principals. The RFP required consultants to provide details on the above listed categories as well as indicate the assigned Architectural Lead. The RFP also requested that a pricing option be given for the design of a second storey above the administrative office area, for the possible relocation of the Engineering Staff to the new facility.

Of the six (6) consultants invited to submit proposal documents, five (5) consultants submitted proposals on November 19, 2012 at the time of closing. The result of the RFP opening is attached. The entire process and opening proceedings adhered to policies and past practices as previously adopted and endorsed by Council.

3) STAFF COMMENTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The TAC scored IBI Group, McCallum Sather Architects Inc., Raimondo + Associates Architects Inc. and Stantec Architecture Ltd. based on technical content and therefore eligible for cost points. All of the proposals were very close in technical content.

Morrison Hershfield did not submit the proposal as per the instructions in the RFP document; as such this proposal was not reviewed.

URS Architects & Engineers Canada Inc. declined the opportunity to submit a proposal for this project.

Based on conversations with the consultants, the design of the PCOC can be initiated as soon as an agreement is signed between the City and the successful consultant. This process would adhere to the proposed schedule for the new facility.

McCallum Sather Architects Inc. scored the highest as indicated on the scoring chart with the Fee Proposal scores added in Attachment 2.

The TAC feels that McCallum Sather Architects Inc. past project experience and capabilities will compliment the needs of the City’s Operations Department. Our Project Manager, PRISM Partners has previously worked with McCallum Sather on similar projects with very positive results.

The Fee Proposal was based on an Order of Magnitude Estimate for construction cost of \$5.17 million based on the most recent “order of magnitude” cost estimate prepared during the previous Environmental Assessment Report for the Operations Centre. The calculated fee proposed by McCallum Sather Architects Inc. equals \$361,400 excluding

applicable taxes. Based on the previous approved cost of \$191,000 for the Project Management firm, the above fee proposal as submitted by McCallum Sather Architects Inc. is within our current budget of \$800,000. See Attachment 3 for a breakdown of the proposed budget for the PCOC.

The Additional Scope of work required the Architect to consider a design for a proposed Second Storey Office Space. This discussion was initiated by the Chief Administrative Officer in regards to the announcement made at the September 24, 2012 Council meeting that the Showboat Theatre would be ceasing operations at the end of 2012. There have been discussions regarding the possible sale of the Roselawn Centre since the theatre company was the main tenant. Staff has suggested that the Engineering Division could occupy the proposed Second Story Office Space at the New Operations Centre to combine the Engineering & Operations Department under one roof. With this proposed move, a portion of the second floor of City Hall would be made available for the Community Services Division and the Economic Development/Tourism Division to occupy. These strategic moves would allow for the City to potentially reduce operating costs as the number of properties and buildings occupied by City Staff would be reduced to only the Vale Health & Wellness Centre, City Hall and the proposed PCOC which all are much more energy efficient as compared to the Roselawn Centre.

There have also been concerns raised regarding service delivery to the public if the Engineering Division were to move out of City Hall. This is a moot issue since all electronic files are on a central network which can be accessed remotely and coordinated with other departments that remain at City Hall. The majority of the concerns or issues currently brought to the Engineering Division are in some way directly related to the Operations Division and it may be cost effective to combine both of these divisions within one building to increase the operating efficiency of the Engineering & Operations Department.

City Staff are requesting that the debentured funds allotted for in the 2012 Capital Budget be utilized to hire a Design firm to complete the detailed design for the facility as per the process outlined above.

It is the recommendation of Staff at this time that Council accept the Proposal as submitted by McCallum Sather Architects Inc. and award the Request for Proposal for an Architect for the Port Colborne Operations Centre (PCOC) Design-Bid-Build Project to them. This will allow the City to enter into an agreement McCallum Sather Architects Inc. and to initiate the design process as soon as details and scheduling allow.

In 2012, council budgeted \$800,000 which will have been used to hire a Project Management firm and will be used to hire an Architectural firm to complete the detailed design during 2012/2013 for construction to begin later in 2013.

4) OPTIONS AND FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS:

a) Do nothing.

- Not an Option. The existing Public Works building does not allow the Operations Staff to function safely or efficiently. (not recommended)

b) Other Options

- As recommended in this report, approve a contract with McCallum Sather Architects Inc. to prepare a detailed design for the PCOC. The price proposed is \$361,400 for design services. It is suggested that the Council of the City of Port Colborne initiate discussions to determine if the Additional Scope as discussed above is required as this will alter the foundation designs for the PCOC. It should be noted that the cost of the Architect is a component of the original submission and plan. It will form part of the cost of the structure as originally planned. **(recommended)**
- Council could direct re-tendering or choosing an alternative bidder. The evaluation team worked diligently in the evaluation of the submissions. The emphasis was on the fact that this phase of the construction of the facility is the most important. It has to be correct the first time as the facility will be a 40 to 50 year facility. (not recommended)

5) COMPLIANCE WITH STRATEGIC PLAN INITIATIVES

- 2011 Strategic Planning Session: Engineering & Operations
 - Complete a review of preferred sites for a new Operations Centre and prepare a report to Council outlining a strategy for the location and building of the new facility.

6) ATTACHMENTS

1. Project Schedule
2. Technical Content Scoring Sheet with Fee Proposal – Form 5 (scores included)
3. Breakdown of Proposed Budget

7) RECOMMENDATION

- A) That the Council of the City of Port Colborne award the Request for Proposal – Architect for the Port Colborne Operations Centre (PCOC) Design-Bid-Build Project to McCallum Sather Architects Inc. of Hamilton, Ontario for the total proposed price of \$361,400 plus applicable taxes.**
- B) AND THAT the project be debentured in the amount of \$361,400 excluding taxes through the Infrastructure Ontario Loan Program for a period of 30 years.**
- C) AND THAT the appropriate By-laws be drafted and submitted for execution by the Mayor and City Clerk.**

8) SIGNATURES

Prepared on November 29, 2012 by:

Reviewed by:

Jim Huppunen, A.Sc.T.
Manager of Engineering Services

Ron Hanson, C.E.T.
Director of Engineering & Operations

Reviewed by:

Reviewed and Respectfully Submitted:

Peter Senese
Director of Corporate and
Community Services

Robert J. Heil
Chief Administrative Officer